An advantage of the proposed boundary is the use of the A 5 Ring Road which will help make the scheme more understandable for drivers

2.2 The CAZ creates unfair difficulties for those located just inside its border
Some respondents felt that the location of the A is unfair and creates difficulties for those who

NO emissions This marginal change was considered not to be sufficient enough to ensure that NO compliance in Birmingham would be achieved earlier

In addition the outer ring road would affect a significantly larger number of vehicles with significant likelihood that this would put pressure on the nd hand market. The cost and practicality of implementing the option will be prohibitive

2.4 The A38 through the city centre should not be inded

9 of individual respondents who answered question iQ felt that the A tunnels through the city centre should not be included. The A is seen as an essential link between the north and south of the city and by including the A in the A would result in more congestion and pollution on the ring road with drivers seeking alternative routes to avoid the A

BCC responseThe A has some of the highest exceedances of NOx within Birmingham and therefore by excluding the A from the lean Air one we would not meet the required air quality targets within the timescales set Scenarios where the A through the city centre are closed or only through traffic was allowed on the A suggested that congestion and air quality issues were likely to be displaced to other parts of the city centre

Although it has been noted that there will be some increases in traffic on the eastern section of the ring road it is not anticipated to be significant and will not lead to a displacement of poor air quality. For longer journeys there are alternative routes for traffic which are more appropriate

Theme B Vehicles included within the charges

This section addresses comments made during the consultation regarding which vehicles should be included within the charges of the lean Air one Respondents were asked to provide details on the type of vehicle used and the frequency and purpose of trips made into the lean Air one omparisons have been made with existing data to understand who has responded to the consultation omments addressed relating to this theme include:

noccongor		
Dasseriuei		
paccoligo		

The results show that there was a higher response to the consultation by people who currently drive or are a passenger in a vehicle travelling into the A than those that use public transport compared against the percentage of trips collected in the census It is worth noting that most consultations attract more responses from people who are negatively impacted by the scheme than

the A against those who take public transport

5 5 of individuals stated that they would be charged to drive their main vehicle into the A and a further of people unsure whether they would be charged to enter the zone

BCC response the non A scenario forecast suggests that 7 of vehicles entering the A will be compliant by without a lean Air one implemented. This percentage increases to a forecast 96 6 in a scenario with the A Table 2.2 shows the number of non compliant vehicles entering the A

CAZ Option

prohibitively expensive. However others stated that buses were seen as the largest polluters and therefore should have the highest charge applied to them

BCC response: make a large contribution to air pollution on a per vehicle basis and in order to meet legal air quality targets in the shortest possible time buses n

requires motorcycles to be a minimum of Euro Analysis of registration information suggests that almost three quarters of the motorcycle scooter and moped fleet in Birmingham meets this standard

It is therefore proposed that thy will not be charged to enter the lean Air one However the ouncil will keep this position under review

Some respondents felt that taxis should be charged due to the perception that many of them ran old and heavily polluting engines; making many trips per day. However, others felt that they should be excluded on the grounds that they provide a public service by transporting workers and visitors and any charge would be passed on to the customer.

BCC response the lean Air one requirements for taxis are in line with the licencing policy that was consulted with the taxi and private hire trade in 7 Therefore regardless of the lean Air one requirements taxis would need to meet euro petrol or euro 6 diesel to be able to operate in Birmingham The mitigation package available to hackney carriage drivers can be seen in Theme F

The consultation documents outlined that electric hybrid vehicles would not be charged to enter the lean Air one however respondents stated that there are not sufficient charge points in Birmingham ity entre

BCC response Birmingham has the highest proportion of licenced electric vehicles outside of ondon as of mid Fully electric or hydrogen fuel cell vehicles will not be charged for entering or moving through a lean Air one Hybrid vehicles which meet minimum euro standards will also not be charged to enter the lean Air one as set out in the lean Air one Framework Drivers of

charging network

Birmingham ity ouncil is looking into ways to improve the electric charging infrastructure in the city. There are a number of grants available for individuals and businesses to implement charging points at their home or workplaces.

Some felt that GV s should be included within the charge as commercial companies organisations are more likely to have the means and scope to change their behaviour or their vehicles

BCC response:

corresponds to of NOx emissions in the city. Therefore in order to meet air legal limits of air

charges

Many respondents felt that lorries and HGV s should be subject to the charge as they were seen as the most polluting

BCC response: Results from the ANPR study in 6 show that HGVs account for of NOx Of this approximately of the HGV fleet is compliant as of 6

3 Theme C Levelof Charge

The West Midlands Bus Alliance the first of its kind in the UK is committed to improving bus services in the region by working in partnership with bus operators local councils and other partners to drive forward investment in our bus services. The Alliance objectives include making bus journeys better value whilst tackling congestion and making bus journeys quicker and more reliable.

7 respondents commented that the lean Air one would make visiting families or friends within the zone exp

percentage of non compliant vehicles that would avoid the zone

people mentioned that they would leave Birmingham 7 of the population of Birmingham and r

BCC response the introduction of a lean Air one in Birmingham will result in a reduction in air pollution and travel behavioural changes that will bring a number of wider social economic and environmental benefits including health benefits improved mental health reduced risk of premature death and prevention of chronic diseases. These benefits are not just seen within the city centre but elsewhere as well due to the cleaner composition of fleet in the Birmingham area.

Some felt it was unlikely that less vehicles would use the roads but rather that traffic would use other roads to avoid driving through the lean Air one therefore creating congestion and pollution elsewhere

BCC response:

numbers of this benefit cannot be quantified but international experience shows that air quality is a factor for people

5.3 Address roadworks issues

Respondents felt that more could be done to ensure roadworks were carried out and completed in an efficient manner Road closures for no apparent reason with no work undertaken was mentioned

BCC responsethe city is going through an unprecedented level of redevelopment with various Government funded schemes e.g. Metro and HS and private developments e.g. Paradise and Arena entral happening within the same time span. All of these are being undertaken to improve public transport increase retail etc within the city centre and provide more employment opportunities. These schemes often take considerable time to construct and will inevitably overlap in timing.

Sometimes cones are left out despite work not taking place at that time as removal can cause more disruption and delays. Also in some cases this is a Health and Safety risk as there may be

Some fe

U EV vehicles

5.7 Introduce live pollution monitors

people aware of the actual pollution levels would encourage people to take action

BCC responseDefra publish an interactive monitoring map showing current levels of pollution at monitoring sites three of which are in Birmingham <a href="https://linear.org/https://lin

In Birmingham we have more monitoring stations than those used by Defra; data from these form our annual status report. The monitoring stations only measure the pollution at this fixed points. Using what we know about sources of pollutions such as roads airports and industrial sites we are able to create a computer model called Airviro which predicts levels of pollutants across the city.

5.8 Encourage motorbikes and scooters

Respondents felt that more should be done to encourage motorbikes and scooters as they were seen as low level polluters

BCC response to council will continue to make it safe for people who wish to use motorbikes and scooters

Theme F Discounts Exemptions

Many respondents believed support should be offered to some user groups who would be most impacted Issues and suggestions here include:

People with disabilities and their carers
Residents within the A

People on low income

Small and local businesses

ommuters and workers

Taxi drivers

BCC response:

for visitors to avoid the A It is vital that individuals are not discouraged from attending health care services as a result of financial pressure A one year exemption from the date of implementation

5.10 Exemptions for people withdisabilities and their carers

Respondents felt that it was unrealistic to expect those with physical disabilities to stop using their cars and travel by public transport

BCC response/ehicles within the disabled passenger vehicle tax class will be given a one year exemption from the date of implementation. People with disabilities living within the zone would qualify for a two year exemption from implementation and an opportunity to trade in their non compliant vehicle for towards the purchase of a compliant vehicle at the end of the exemption period. Blue badge holders have been not been made exempt because the volume of blue badge holders within Bi

Ultra low emission van

5.14 Commuters and workers

Some respondents felt that commuters and workers should receive discounts exemptions in order to make necessary changes to their work travel plans given the speed with which the lean Air one is proposed to come into effect

BCC responset is forecast that 97 of cars entering the lean Air one will be compliant in ow income workers working within the zone will receive a one year exemption from the charge Key workers who provide essential services to society so should not have costs imposed that may incentivise them to change jobs Therefore a one year exemption has been given to those who

5.15 Taxi drivers

Some respondents felt that the impact of the A charge may be especially felt by taxi drivers which could cause some to seek work elsewhere

BCC response Birmingham icenced taxi drivers with non compliant Hackney carriages will be offered support payments towards the purchase or lease of a U EV vehicle. This is forecast as years Alternatively the target group can choose to receive a grant with which to install an accredited retrofit technology making their vehicle compliant. Birmingham ity ouncil has also asked the government for funding to purchase or lease 5 UEV taxis which will then be leased out to the most vulnerable hackney carriage drivers

million has been secured from the Office for ow Emission Vehicles to support implementation of a city level electric vehicle chargepoint network to include 97 charging points for taxis which will help support the change to ultra low emission vehicles

For private hire vehicles the council proposes a grant to support PHV compliance to either euro 6 diesel euro petrol or other deaner low emission vehicle

5.16 People travelling to within the CAZ for purposes of worship
5.167 TJ ET BT /F5 11.04 Tf 1 0 0 1 76.344 317.02 Tm 0() TJ ET BT /F3 11.04 Tf 1 0 0 1 85.464 317.02
76 of individuals and 7 of organisations agreed that people attending a place of worship should be given support however those opposed to the support argued that worship was a choice and not especially different from other leisure activities

BCC responset was decided that anions role atnoting a placef worship sw o 5 p ld 5 nu fe

Accessibility will also be covered in mitigation measures targeted at the taxi community to ensure wheelchair accessible vehicles remain available to elderly and disabled residents

5.18 Those regularly passing through the CAZ, but not stopping

to somewhere outside of the city should receive discounts exemption which would help lessen congestion and pollution on the Ring Road

BCC response the ANPR study undertaken in 6 indicates that of trips through Birmingham are through trips that do not start or finish within the city centre. The traffic modelling shows that there will be slight increases in traffic on the Ring Road overall, however many people will upgrade their vehicle to be compliant, switch to public transport or re-route via an alternative route and avoid the Ring Road.

made some exemptions for certain users for one year from implementation details of which can be	

6.8 Reduced business rates and/or rent

Some organisations felt that a reduction in rent and or business rates would help offset the cost of the A and the projected loss of earnings due to an expected reduction in um elrc mmn5 o 5 f

]T ETE